

A Timeline for Logic, λ -Calculus, and Programming Language Theory

Dana S. Scott

University Professor Emeritus
Carnegie Mellon University

Visiting Scholar
University of California, Berkeley

`dana.scott@cs.cmu.edu`

Taken from talks prepared for:

TURING CENTENNIAL CELEBRATION
Princeton University, May 10-12, 2012

ACM TURING CENTENARY CELEBRATION
San Francisco, June 15-16, 2012

A Quick Look Back to Beginnings

1870s

Begriffsschrift Frege (1879)

1880s

What are numbers? Dedekind (1888)

Number-theoretic axioms Peano (1889)

1890s

Vorlesungen über die Algebra der Logik Schröder (1890–1905)

Grundgesetze der Arithmetik Frege (1893-1903)

Formulario Mathematico Peano (1895-1901)

Grundlagen der Geometrie Hilbert (1899)

1900s

Diophantine problem Hilbert (1900)

Russell's Paradox Russell (1901)

Principles of Mathematics Russell (1903)

Richard's Paradox Richard (1905)

Theory of Types Russell (1908)

1910s

Principia Mathematica Whitehead-Russell (1910-12-13)

Calculus of relatives Löwenheim (1915)

WW I

1920s

Löwenheim-Skolem Theorem Skolem (1920)

Propositional calculus completeness Post (1921)

Monadic predicate calculus decidable Behmann (1922)

Abstract proof rules Hertz (1922)

Primitive recursive arithmetic Skolem (1923)

Combinators Schönfinkel (1924)

Function-based set theory von Neumann (1925)

"Conceptual" undecidability Finsler (1926)

Epsilon operator Hilbert-Bernays (1927)

Combinators (again) Curry (1927)

Ackermann function Ackermann (1928)

Entscheidungsproblem Hilbert-Ackermann (1928)

Abriss der Logistik & simple type theory Carnap (1929)

It was very reasonable for Hilbert and Ackermann to emphasize the Decision Problem, as special cases had been solved.

A Very Busy Decade

1930s

<i>Combinatory logic</i>	Curry (1930-32)
<i>Herbrand's Theorem</i>	Herbrand (1930)
<i>Completeness proof</i>	Gödel (1930)
<i>Partial consistency proof</i>	Herbrand (1931)
<i>Incompleteness</i>	Gödel (1931)
<i>Untyped λ-calculus</i>	Church (1932-33-41)
<i>Studies of primitive recursion</i>	Péter (1932-36)
<i>Non-standard models</i>	Skolem (1933)
<i>Functionality in Combinatory Logic</i>	Curry (1934)
<i>Grundlagen der Mathematik</i>	Hilbert-Bernays (1934-39)
<i>Natural deduction</i>	Gentzen (1934)
<i>Number-theoretic consistency & ε_0-induction</i>	Gentzen (1934)
<i>Inconsistency of Church's System</i>	Kleene-Rosser (1936)
<i>Confluence theorem</i>	Church-Rosser (1936)
<i>Finite combinatory processes</i>	Post (1936)
<i>Turing machines</i>	Turing (1936-37)
<i>Recursive undecidability</i>	Church-Turing (1936)
<i>General recursive functions</i>	Kleene (1936)
<i>Further completeness proofs</i>	Maltsev (1936)
<i>Improving incompleteness theorems</i>	Rosser (1936)
<i>Fixed-point combinator</i>	Turing (1937)
<i>Computability and λ-definability</i>	Turing (1937)

**Starting out with Gödel and ending up with Turing,
it would take a long time to comprehend
and apply all the developments in this period.**

What's Happened Since the 1930s?

The 1940s

Simple type theory & λ -calculus Church (1940)

Primitive recursive functionals Gödel (1941-58)

WW II

Recursive hierarchies Kleene (1943)

Theory of categories Eilenberg-Mac Lane (1945)

New completeness proofs Henkin (1949-50)

The 1950s

Computing and Intelligence Turing (1950)

Rethinking combinators Rosenbloom (1950)

IAS Computer (MANIAC) von Neumann (1951)

Introduction to Metamathematics Kleene (1952)

IBM 701 Thomas Watson, Jr. (1952)

Arithmetical predicates Kleene (1955)

FORTRAN Backus et al. (1956-57)

ALGOL 58 Bauer et al. (1958)

LISP McCarthy (1958)

Combinatory Logic. Volume I. Curry-Feys-Craig (1958)

Adjoint functors Kan (1958)

Recursive functionals & quantifiers, I.&II. Kleene (1959-63)

Countable functionals Kleene-Kreisel (1959)

The 1960s

<i>Recursive procedures</i>	Dijkstra (1960)
ALGOL 60	Backus et al. (1960)
<i>Elementary formal systems</i>	Smullyan (1961)
<i>Grothendieck topologies</i>	M. Artin (1962)
<i>Higher-type λ-definability</i>	Kleene (1962)
<i>Grothendieck topoi</i>	Grothendieck et al. SGA 4 (1963-64-72)
CPL	Strachey, et al. (1963)
<i>Functorial semantics</i>	Lawvere (1963)
Continuations (1)	van Wijngaarden (1964)
<i>Adjoint functors & triples</i>	Eilenberg-Moore (1965)
•Cartesian closed categories•	Eilenberg-Kelly (1966)
ISWIM & SECD machine	Landin (1966)
CUCH & combinator programming	Böhm (1966)
<i>New foundations of recursion theory</i>	Platek (1966)
<i>Normalization Theorem</i>	Tait (1967)
AUTOMATH & dependent types	de Bruijn (1967)
<i>Finite-type computable functionals</i>	Gandy (1967)
ALGOL 68	van Wijngaarden (1968)
<i>Normal-form discrimination</i>	Böhm (1968)
<i>Category of sets</i>	Lawvere (1969)
<i>Typed domain logic</i>	Scott (1969-93)
<i>Domain-theoretic λ-models</i>	Scott (1969)
<i>Formulae-as-types</i>	Howard (1969 -1980)
<i>Adjointness in foundations</i>	Lawvere (1969)

Theorem. The category of \mathbf{T}_0 -topological spaces and continuous functions is *not* cartesian closed.

Theorem. The category of \mathbf{T}_0 -topological spaces *with* an equivalence relation and continuous functions *respecting* equivalences *is* cartesian closed.

Cartesian closed categories give us the algebraic version of typed λ -calculus.

The 1970s

Continuations (2)	Mazurkiewicz (1970)
Continuations (3)	F. Lockwood Morris (1970)
Continuations (4)	Wadsworth (1970)
<i>Categorical logic</i>	Joyal (1970+)
<i>Elementary topoi</i>	Lawvere-Tierney (1970)
<i>Denotational semantics</i>	Scott-Strachey (1970)
<i>Coherence in closed categories</i>	Kelly (1971)
<i>Quantifiers and sheaves</i>	Lawvere (1971)
<i>Martin-Löf type theory</i>	Martin-Löf (1971)
<i>System F, $F\omega$</i>	Girard (1971)
<i>Logic for Computable Functions</i>	Milner (1972)
<i>From sheaves to logic</i>	Reyes (1974)
<i>Polymorphic λ-calculus</i>	Reynolds (1974)
<i>Call-by-name, call-by-value</i>	Plotkin (1975)
<i>Modeling Processes</i>	Milner (1975)
SASL	Turner (1975)
Scheme	Sussman-Steele (1975-80)
Functional programming & FP	Backus (1977)
<i>First-order categorical logic</i>	Makkai-Reyes (1977)
Edinburgh LCF	Milner et al. (1978)
<i>Let-polymorphic type inference</i>	Milner (1978)
<i>Intersection types</i>	Coppo-Dezani (1978)
ML	Milner et al. (1979)
<i>*-Autonomous categories</i>	Barr (1979)
<i>Sheaves and logic</i>	Fourman-Scott (1979)

This decade saw the importance of constructive logic, the applications to language design and semantics, and the connections to category theory become much clearer.

The 1980s

<i>Frege structures</i>	Aczel (1980)
HOPE	Burstall et al. (1980)
<i>The Lambda Calculus Book</i>	Barendregt (1981-84)
<i>Structural Operational Semantics</i>	Plotkin (1981)
<i>Effective Topos</i>	Hyland (1982)
<i>Dependent types & modularity</i>	Burstall-Lampson (1984)
<i>Locally CCC & type theory</i>	Seely (1984)
<i>Calculus of Constructions</i>	Coquand-Huet (1985)
<i>Bounded quantification</i>	Cardelli-Wegner (1985)
NUPRL	Constable et al. (1986)
<i>Higher-order categorical logic</i>	Lambek-P.J.Scott (1986)
Cambridge LCF	Paulson (1987)
<i>Linear logic</i>	Girard et al. (1987-89)
HOL	Gordon (1988)
FORSYTHE	Reynolds (1988)
<i>Proofs and Types</i>	Girard et al. (1989)
<i>Integrating logical & categorical types</i>	Gray (1989)
<i>Computational λ-calculus & monads</i>	Moggi (1989)

Type theory, resource logic, and computer-assisted theorem proving finally became practical during these years.

The 1990s

HASKELL	Hudak-Hughes-Peyton Jones-Wadler (1990)
<i>Higher-type recursion theory</i>	Sacks (1990)
STANDARD ML	Milner, et al. (1990-97)
<i>Lazy λ-calculus</i>	Abramsky (1990)
<i>Higher-order subtyping</i>	Cardelli-Longo (1991)
<i>Categories, Types and Structure</i>	Asperti-Longo (1991)
STANDARD ML of NJ	MacQueen-Appel (1991-98)
QUEST	Cardelli (1991)
Edinburgh LF	Harper, et al. (1992)
Pi-Calculus	Milner-Parrow-Walker (1992)
<i>Categorical combinators</i>	Curien (1993)
<i>Translucent types & modular</i>	Harper-Lillibridge (1994)
<i>Full abstraction for PCF</i>	Hyland-Ong/Abramsky, et al. (1995)
<i>Algebraic set theory</i>	Joyal-Moerdijk (1995)
<i>Object Calculus</i>	Abadi-Cardelli (1996)
<i>Typed intermediate languages</i>	Tarditi, Morrisett, et al. (1996)
<i>Proof-carrying code</i>	Necula-Lee (1996)
<i>Computability and totality in domains</i>	Berger (1997)
<i>Typed assembly language</i>	Morrisett, et al. (1998)
<i>Type theory via exact categories</i>	Birkedal, et al. (1998)
<i>Categorification</i>	Baez (1998)

**Abstract ideas now found many applications in
language implementation and in compiling.**

The New Millennium

<i>Predicative topos</i>	Moerdijk-Palmgren (2000)
<i>Sketches of an Elephant</i>	Johnstone (2002+)
<i>Differential λ-calculus</i>	Ehrhard/Regnier (2003)
<i>Modular Structural Operational Semantics</i>	Mosses (2004)
<i>A λ-calculus for real analysis</i>	Taylor (2005+)
<i>Homotopy type theory</i>	Awodey-Warren (2006)
<i>Univalence axiom</i>	Voevodsky (2006+)
<i>The safe λ-calculus</i>	Ong, et al. (2007)
<i>Higher topos theory</i>	Lurie (2009)
<i>Functional Reactive Programming</i>	Hudak, et al. (2010)
<i>Univalent Foundations Program @ IAS & HoTT Book</i> <i>Voevodsky, et al. (2012-13)</i>	

In the natural world, **convergent evolution** can give creatures analogous structures – even though they cannot mate. But, in the intellectual world, analogous structures can be taken advantage of through interfertilization of areas and in finding new applications.

And that we have seen happen with the λ -calculus many, many times over the years.